



TOWN OF TIBURON
1505 Tiburon Boulevard
Tiburon, CA 94920

Design Review Board Meeting
September 15, 2016
Agenda Item: **4**

STAFF REPORT

To: Members of the Design Review Board

From: Planning Manager Watrous

Subject: 173 Stewart Drive; File No. DR2016036; Consider Adoption of a Resolution Denying a Site Plan and Architectural Review Application for Construction of a New Single-Family Dwelling; Afie Royo, Owner; Assessor Parcel Number: 055-101-21

Reviewed By: _____

BACKGROUND

Following a public hearing and discussion at its September 1, 2016 regular meeting, the Design Review Board directed to staff to prepare a draft resolution denying a Site Plan and Architectural Review application for construction of a new single-family dwelling on property located at 173 Stewart Drive. The resolution was to be considered for adoption at the next regular meeting.

The draft resolution is attached as **Exhibit 1**. Draft minutes of the September 1, 2016 meeting are also included in the Design Review Board packet.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Board adopt the draft resolution denying the subject application.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Draft resolution

Prepared By: Daniel M. Watrous, Planning Manager

RESOLUTION NO. 2016-01

A RESOLUTION OF THE DESIGN REVIEW BOARD OF THE TOWN OF TIBURON DENYING A SITE PLAN AND ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW APPLICATION FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW SINGLE-FAMILY DWELLING AT 173 STEWART DRIVE

ASSESSOR PARCEL NO. 055-101-21

WHEREAS, the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon does resolve as follows:

Section 1. Findings.

- A. The Town of Tiburon received an application for Site Plan and Architectural Review for the construction of a new single-family dwelling (File #DR2016036) on property located at 173 Stewart Drive. The application consists of the following:
1. Application form and supplemental materials received March 29, 2016; and
 2. Site plan, floor plans and elevations prepared by Joseph Farrell, received April 18, 2016, and revised plans dated August 22, 2016.
- B. The Design Review Board held a duly-noticed public hearing on this project on May 19, 2016. At that meeting, several neighboring residents raised concerns about the accuracy of the story poles and the height of the house. The Design Review Board did not support the project design and Board reiterated its concerns that were raised during the review of a previous application for this property, stating that having all of the living area on the upper floor without extending the lower floor was contrary to the Hillside Design Guidelines and that the eventual removal of the pine trees on the site would make the house very visible when viewed from below on Sierra Court. The Board encouraged the applicant to consider placing some of the floor area on the lower floor, which could require some excavation on the site. The application was continued to the July 7, 2016 meeting, and further continued until September 1, 2016 at the request of the applicant.
- C. The applicant subsequently submitted revised plans for the project that only marginally changed the project design. The roof was slightly reconfigured to lower the ridge height above the southern portion of the house by 1 foot 2 inches to 2 feet, 4 inches. The dining room windows were reduced in size by 25%. The main floor kitchen was 6 inches narrower and the lower floor laundry was pulled back 6 inches. The curved patio design was squared off and the glass railing was replaced with a solid railing. Otherwise, the floor plans were identical to the previous design and the floor area and lot coverage of the house remained unchanged.
- D. The Design Review Board held a duly-noticed public hearing on this project on September 1, 2016 to review the revised plans. At that meeting, several neighboring

residents again raised concerns about the overall size of the proposed house and visual mass and bulk when viewed from other homes in the vicinity. At that meeting, the Design Review Board reviewed revised plans for the proposed project in accordance with Section 16-52.020 (H) of the Tiburon Zoning Code (Guiding Principles in the Review of Site Plan and Architectural Review Applications), and the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines and determined that the project plans were inconsistent with these principles and guidelines. The consensus of the Board was that not enough had been done to substantially change the design of the house. The Boardmembers felt that it was unreasonable to expand the house on a single plane on a hillside lot and that there was adequate room to expand beneath the main level of the house. The Design Review Board voted to direct staff to prepare a resolution denying this application.

- E. The Design Review Board finds, based upon application materials and analysis presented in the May 19, 2016 and September 1, 2016 Staff Reports, public testimony, as well as visits to the site, that the proposed construction of a new single-family dwelling at this site would look too tall and massive when viewed from below and would be exacerbated by the placement of all the floor area onto the main level.
- F. The Design Review Board further finds that that the application is inconsistent with the guiding principle of Tiburon Zoning Ordinance Section 16.52.020 (H [1]), which states:

“Site plan adequacy: Proper relation of a project to its site, including that it promotes orderly development of the community, provides safe and reasonable access, and will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, and general welfare.”

The Design Review Board finds that the placement of all the floor area of the proposed house on the upper level of the building would not be properly related to the physical characteristics of this hillside corner lot and would result in visual mass when viewed from below that would not be consistent with the orderly development of the properties in the surrounding neighborhood.

- G. The Design Review Board further finds that that the application is inconsistent with the goals and principles of the Tiburon Hillside Design Guidelines. Goal 1 of the Guidelines encourages projects to “reduce effective visual bulk of a structure and to avoid monumental and excessively large buildings.” Goal 1, Principle 1 encourages projects to “cut [a] building into [the] hillside to reduce effective visual bulk.” The Design Review Board finds that the proposed house would place too much of its floor area on the upper level of the building and fail to cut the building appropriately into the hillside to the effective visual bulk of the building.

Section 2. Denial.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon does hereby deny the application for Site Plan and Architectural Review for the reasons set forth above.

PASSED AND ADOPTED at a regular meeting of the Design Review Board of the Town of Tiburon on September 15, 2016, by the following vote:

AYES: BOARDMEMBERS:

NOES: BOARDMEMBERS:

ABSENT: BOARDMEMBERS:

JOHN KRICKENSKY, CHAIR
TIBURON DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

ATTEST:

DANIEL M. WATROUS, SECRETARY